

- Regarding the mental basis of the six clairvoyances, someone asserts: "Whatever is the mental basis of any of the six clairvoyances is necessarily a fourth concentration because Maitreya says in his **Ornament of the Mahayana Sutra (Mahāyāna-sūtrālamkāra-kārikā)**:
Having attained the very pure fourth concentration,...

Our reply to this is that there is no pervasion, i.e. even though Maitreya says that the six clairvoyances rely on the fourth concentration it does not mean that whatever is the mental basis of the six clairvoyances is necessarily the fourth concentration. The reason for this is that Maitreya actually means that merely the *principal* mental basis of the six clairvoyances is the fourth concentration. This is supported by Asanga who says in his **Compendium of Manifest Knowledge (Abhidharmasamuccaya)**:

...obtained in dependence on any of the four pure concentrations...

- Furthermore, regarding the clairvoyance of the removal of defilements, someone says: "An Arhat that has not attained the clairvoyance of the removal of defilements does not exist."

This is not correct because there are Arhats who have attained an actual concentration and there are Arhats who have not attained an actual concentration. The reason for this is that there are Arhats who are called 'Having an Ornament' and Arhats who are called 'Not having an Ornament'. Here the 'Ornament' refers to an actual concentration.

- Regarding the assertion that the first five clairvoyances are attained by non-Buddhists, someone holds: "It follow that the clairvoyance of knowing others' minds exists in the continua of Charvakas (Hedonists/Nihilists) because the first five clairvoyances are asserted to exist in the continua of non-Buddhists. If one were to accept that the clairvoyance of knowing others' mind exists in the continua of Charvakas it would follow that these Charvakas have in their continua the clairvoyance that knows a Buddhist's awareness which realizes the four seals (i.e. all conditioned phenomena are impermanent, all contaminated phenomena are in the nature of suffering, all phenomena are selfless and empty, and Nirvana is peace). If one were to accept that Charvakas have in their continua the clairvoyance that knows a Buddhist's awareness which realizes the four seals it would follow that it is not correct that Charvakas due to their grasping at true existence knowingly assert that conditioned phenomena are *permanent*.

Furthermore, it follows that the clairvoyance of recalling former lives exists in the continua of Charvakas because the first five clairvoyances are asserted to exist in the continua of non-Buddhists. If one were to accept that the clairvoyance of recalling former lives exists in the continua of Charvakas it would follow that there are Charvakas who directly know their previous lives. If one were to accept that there are Charvakas who directly know their previous lives it would follow that there are Charvakas who assert past and future lives.

Our own reply to this debate is that there is no fault because either one asserts that Charvakas deny the existence of direct perception and thus do not believe in the accuracy of their own perception or one asserts that only those Charvakas who have not attained a clairvoyance accept that compositional phenomena are permanent and that there are no past and future lives.

The definitions of each of the six clairvoyances according to our own system are as follows:

- (1) The definition of the clairvoyance of magical emanation is: That which is one of the six clairvoyances and which is able to move the earth, and so forth.
- (2) The definition of the clairvoyance of a celestial ear is: That which is one of the six clairvoyances and which in dependence on its empowering condition, a nose sense power, knows coarse and subtle sounds of the world system.
- (3) The definition of the clairvoyance of knowing others' minds is: That which is one of the six clairvoyances and which knows all kinds of others' minds.

- (4) The definition of the clairvoyance of recalling former lives is: That which is one of the six clairvoyances and which remembers one's former lives.
- (5) The definition of the clairvoyance of a celestial eye is: That which is one of the six clairvoyances and which in dependence on its empowering condition, an eye sense power, knows coarse and subtle forms of the world system.
- (6) The definition of the clairvoyance of the removal of defilements is: That which is one of the six clairvoyances and which has eliminated afflictive obstructions.

This completes the presentation of the six clairvoyances according to Panchen Sonam Drakpa's **Decisive Analysis**.

Next follow four passages from Lama Tsongkhapa's **Golden Rosary** that provide some additional explanations.

The first passage from the **Golden Rosary** gives clarifying explanations regarding the nature of the clairvoyance of magical emanation:

The clairvoyance of magical emanation: Its objects are the moving of the earth, etc., the transformation of that which is one into many, and the transformation of those that are many into one. The clairvoyance [itself refers to the mental factors of] mental stabilization and wisdom that arose from the meditation on exactly demonstrating [its objects, i.e. the moving of the earth, and so forth].

Therefore, Lama Tsongkhapa explains that the clairvoyance of magical emanation refers to either the mental factor of mental stabilization or the mental factor of wisdom. It arose from meditating on its objects which are, for instance, the moving of the earth or the transformation of that which is one into many or the transformation of those that are many into one, and so forth.

The next passage from the **Golden Rosary** describes the objects of the clairvoyance of the celestial eye:

The clairvoyance of the celestial eye, which arose from compositional action, that is, from the force of meditation on [any of the four] concentrations in this lifetime, perceives death-transference and rebirth of all sentient beings of the ten directions as well as [those sentient beings'] excellent, middling, and inferior physical forms.

[The Buddha says:]

Since that completely pure celestial eye transcends the human [realm], it knows sentient beings' death-transference and rebirth, [their] agreeable and disagreeable complexion, agreeable and disagreeable sentient beings, good and bad [sentient beings]; it [knows] exactly [in dependence on] which karma they go to the fortunate and unfortunate states...

Hence, Lama Tsongkhapa explains that the clairvoyance of the celestial eye does not merely perceive *any* coarse and subtle forms but the different physical forms (i.e. physical bodies) of sentient beings after they died and were reborn.

The third passage from the **Golden Rosary** explains the limitation of the six clairvoyances:

Thus, the six clairvoyances can perform magical emanations, and so forth, only on the level on which they are based, or on the levels below that.

Here Lama Tsongkhapa explains that the six clairvoyances can only operate on the level on which the person, in whose continuum they exist, took rebirth in. For instance, if a person resides on the Second Concentration Level his clairvoyances can only operate on the level of the Second Concentration and below. This means that he can produce magical emanations, perceive coarse and subtle sounds, etc. only on the level of the Second Concentration, the First Concentration, and the Desire Realm. However, he is unable to produce magical emanations etc. on the level of the Third Concentration and above.

The fourth passage from the **Golden Rosary** presents the demarcation of the first five clairvoyances:

The first five clairvoyances are common to non-Buddhists. From the point of view of the Mahayana vehicle, [the first five clairvoyances] exist on any stage from the great path of accumulation onwards.

